IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUDICATURE AT BOMBAY

ORDINARY ORIGINAL CIVIL JURISDICTION

INCOME TAX REFERENCE NO.201 OF 1998

The Commissioner of Income-tax ..Applicant.

V/s.

M/s.J.B.Advani & Co. Pvt. Ltd. ..Respondent.

Mr.A.S.Rao for applicant.

CORAM : V.C. DAGA AND J.P.DEVADHAR, JJ.

DATED : 15TH MARCH, 2005.

P.C. :-

1. In this reference, the question referred for the opinion of this Court reads as under :-

> " Whether, on the facts and in the circumstances of the case, the Tribunal was right in law in holding that in computing the disallowance in respect of expenditure which resulted in remuneration benefit or amenities to employee directors, the provisions of section 40(c) and not those of Section 40A(5) of the I.T.Act would be applicable ? "

2. The above question has already been answered by the Division Bench of this Court in the case of **C.I.T. V/s. Hico Products Pvt.Ltd. (No.1) [(1993) 201 I.T.R. 567 (Bom.)** in favour of the assessee and against the revenue. In this view of the matter, question stands answered in affirmative for the reasons stated in the case of Hico Products (P) Ltd. Reference, accordingly stands disposed of with no order as to costs.

(V.C. DAGA, J.)

(J.P.DEVADHAR, J.)